

Effective Mechanisms for Climate Change Mainstreaming in Sub-National Planning



Cambodia Climate Change Alliance (CCCA)

Implemented by: Supported by:



Ministry of
Environment



European Union



Empowered lives
Resilient nations



Danida



UNEP-DHI CENTRE
for Water and Environment



2014

Table of Contents

Foreword.....	iii
Acknowledgement	iv
Summary	v
I. Background	2
1.1 Objective and Approach	2
1.2 Commune Investment Plans for the Target Communes	2
II. Overview of Climate Change Mainstreaming at the National Level.....	3
2.1 Institutional Structure	3
2.2 The Planning Process	4
III. Climate Change Mainstreaming at the Sub-National Level.....	6
3.1 Institutional Structure	6
3.2 Procedures and Process for Sub-National Development Planning	8
3.3 The Process Approach used for Mainstreaming Climate Change	11
IV. Proposed Coordination Mechanism for Sub-national Mainstreaming of Climate Change.....	14
V. Links between National and Sub-national Climate Adaptation	16
VI. Conclusion.....	17
References	18
Annexes – Commune Investment Plans & Small Scale Project Proposals.....	18

Foreword

It is my pleasure to present the report on Effective Mechanisms for Climate Change Mainstreaming in Sub-National Planning in Cambodia. The report is the result of a fruitful collaboration between government agencies at all levels, provincial, district and commune authorities and various NGOs, projects and programmes engaged in coastal development and climate change. This report is part of a series of reports demonstrating activities and approach for mainstreaming climate change adaptation at the sub-national level and developing structures and capacity for implementation of climate change adaptation measures.

The present report provides an overview and a description on effective mechanisms for climate change mainstreaming into the sub-national development planning in Cambodia based on experience obtained through demonstration implementation of six selected demonstration activities in six communes in Prey Nob District, Preah Sihanouk Province and two communes in Mondul Seima District, Koh Kong Province. The report provides an overall summary on mainstreaming activities from inclusion of climate change measures in commune investment plans through district integration workshops and recommendation on formation of climate change coordination units at the provincial level. Overall it provides a comprehensive view on how structures can be established for climate change adaptation at the sub-national level and how communities can adapt to climate change and at the same time improve their livelihood conditions. Besides this the report also presents the investment plans developed for each of the target communes.

The rich natural resources and the environment in the coastal zone have over the past years been under increased pressure due to development activities. Beyond the development pressure also climate change affect the living conditions in the coastal area especially in low laying areas by e.g. increasing the risk of flooding, saline intrusion and coastal erosion. There is a need for improved management in order to ensure much needed socio-economic improvements and economic development in the area without degrading the natural resources and the environment. This is particularly urgent in light of impact of climate change on present livelihood that the coastal communities are developing adaptation to build stronger resilience in the communities which can at the same time be used for replication and expansion to other parts of the coastal area and to other provinces.

The main users of this report will be commune, district, and province authorities and provincial departments in the coastal zone dealing with the complex issues related to socio-economic development alongside climate change and sustainable environment and natural resources management. It is expected that the report will prove valuable for a much wider audience, including national level policy-makers, planners and government agencies, NGOs, other projects and the private sector. The report also offers an important basis for education and research.

I hope all users will find the present report to be a valuable resource for climate change work in Cambodia.



Dr. Lonh Heal

Director General for Technical Affairs
Chairman, Project Steering Committee
Ministry of Environment,
Phnom Penh, Cambodia
15th March 2014

Acknowledgements

This Report was produced under the Coastal Adaptation and Resilience Planning Component, implemented by the CCCA. Its findings are based on lessons learnt from activities implemented under the component.

On behalf of the Coastal Zone Working Groups, I would like to express my profound gratitude to his Excellency **Say Samal**, Minister of Environment and Deputy Chairman of the Cambodia's National Coastal Management and Development for his strong and continued motivation, guidance and support provided to the effort of the working group in developing the report. My profound thanks go to the members of Project Steering Committee, National Focal Point, Provincial Technical Working Groups, National and International Consultants and all relevant stakeholders who contributed and shared their good ideas and comments to this report.

Last but not least, I would like to express my profound thanks to the Cambodia Climate Change Alliance (CCCA) for supporting Coastal Adaptation Resilient Component (CARP) through DHI implementation in a good collaboration with the Ministry of Environment.

Phnom Penh, 15 March 2014



Dr. Vann Monyneath
Permanent Vice Chairperson,
Project Steering Committee

Summary

Climate change planning and mainstreaming is now undertaken at various levels with notable progress achieved at the national level. The Cambodia Climate Change Strategic Plan and Sector Climate Change Strategic Plans have been adopted, which provides a comprehensive policy framework for integration of climate change at national and sub-national levels. Several initiatives and ongoing projects are implemented at provincial levels using both government and international planning practice. The Coastal Adaptation and Climate Resilience Planning component of the CCCA has been implemented since 2012 in eight communes in Prey Nob and Mondol Seima districts in Preah Sihanouk and Koh Kong provinces. The CARP's approach – implementation of demonstration activities and integration of climate change considerations into Commune Development Plans - is based on current government planning procedures and guidelines for sub-national administrations. CARP experience indicates that a clear opportunity exists for mainstreaming climate change into the DP5 and the IP3. However, a lack of formal institutional structures and guidelines will make it difficult to sustain it at the sub-national level. Based on a comprehensive analysis of the current institutional structure for climate change planning at the national level and taking into consideration the parameters of the ongoing D&D reform, the establishment of a Climate Change Coordination Unit as part of the NCCC and the NCDD is proposed. It would benefit from already developed capacity within the TWGs and could recruit additional members using D&D rules and regulations. Its overriding tasks would be to improve planning and budgeting procedures, promote capacity development and establish M&E systems for sub-national climate change planning and implementation. When the improved institutional framework for climate change planning and implementation has been put in place, ongoing activities should be expanded into more coastal areas and in-land provinces.

The CARP is firmly committed to a continuous dialogue, sharing observations, suggestions and recommendations in support of the evolving national mainstreaming processes. NCDD and MOP are seen as key partners in this connection, with NCCC and its secretariat providing important support in many ways, including activation of inter-sector synergies.

The annexes of the report present the demonstration activities implemented in the eight target communes in the format used in the CIPs.

I. Background

1.1 Objective and Approach

The Coastal Adaptation and Resilience Planning Project (CARP) is designed to increase resilience of coastal communities and ecosystems to climate change through adaptation planning, demonstrated targeted local interventions and provision of practical learning exercises under the institutional framework of the National Climate Change Committee (NCCC) and its Climate Change Department. The CARP is one of the components of the project portfolio of the Cambodia Climate Change Alliance (CCCA). The main objectives of CARP include: i) improved climate change knowledge integrated into land use and coastal development plans; ii) increased resilience of coastal communities and coastal system buffers to climate change, and improved livelihoods in the coastal zone. The development of a coordination mechanism for climate change mainstreaming at the sub-national level is part of the assignment on “Integrating Climate Change Considerations for Coastal Areas into Commune Development Plans (CDP) and Commune Investment Programs, and Developed Climate Change Mechanisms”. This coordination mechanism is developed based on 1) an analysis of the current institutional structure for climate change planning at national and sub-national levels and 2) the experiences with and progress made by several initiatives taken and projects implemented at various levels, including the implementation of six adaptation demonstration projects and integration of those projects into CDPs and Commune Investment Programs (CIP). The analytical findings and lessons learnt help improve our understanding of the opportunities and challenges associated with climate change planning at national and sub-national levels.

1.2 Commune Investment Plans for the Target Communes

In annexes 1-8, the demonstration activities have been spelled out according to the format used for CIPs, thereby providing the required details. In addition, a specific template has been included which focuses on climate change considerations in relation to the demonstration projects.

CIPs including climate change demonstration actions have been developed for the following communes:

- 0502: Peam Krasaob Commune, Mondol Seima District
- 0503: Tuol Kokir Commune, Mondol Seima District
- 0206: Ou Oknha Heng Commune, Prey Nob District
- 0207: Prey Nob Commune, Prey Nob District
- 0209: Sameakki Commune, Prey Nob District
- 0211: Tuek L'ak Commune, Prey Nob District
- 0212: Tuek Thla Commune, Prey Nob District
- 0213: Tuol Totueng Commune, Prey Nob District

II. Overview of Climate Change Mainstreaming at the National Level

2.1 Institutional Structure

Good progress has been achieved in developing an institutional framework for coordination of climate change planning and policy responses to the impacts of climate change since Cambodia ratified the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) in 1996. A National Climate Change Committee was set up in 2006 with the mandate to prepare, coordinate and monitor the implementation of all policies, strategies, legal instruments, plans and programmes of the Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) which address climate change issues. The NCCC is a high-level inter-ministerial coordination committee headed by the Prime Minister as an Honorary Chair and the Minister of Environment as Permanent Chairman. The NCCC has members representing 20 line ministries and agencies with representatives of MAFF, MIME and MOWRAM serving as Deputy Chairs. To fulfill its mandate, the NCCC is assisted by a Climate Change Department (CDD) established under the Ministry of Environment and a Climate Change Technical Team (CCTT) formed by technical officers from relevant ministries. The Sub-Decree on the Establishment of the NCCC (April 2006) specifies the role of the NCCC as the following:

- Develop draft climate change policies, strategies, legal instruments, plans and programmes, including national greenhouse gas (GHG) mitigation and climate change adaptation plans, for submission to the Royal Government for consideration and approval;
- Promote and encourage broad participation of all stakeholders in the development and the effective implementation of climate change policies, strategies, legal instruments, plans and programmes to ensure they are in line with the national development objectives and priorities;
- Promote and encourage the integration of climate change concerns into relevant policies, strategies, legal instruments, plans and programmes;
- Mobilise resources, in particular grants, for the implementation of these climate change policies, strategies, legal instruments, plans and programmes;
- Promote the transfer of appropriate technologies, renewable technologies, and conservation and enhancement of carbon sinks;
- Determine national positions and strategies for participating in international negotiations on climate change;
- Review and approve national reports that are required to be prepared by the UNFCCC;
- Coordinate activities concerning the implementation of the UNFCCC, its protocols, and other climate change international agreements to which Cambodia is a party;

- Manage and coordinate the Clean Development Mechanism of the Kyoto Protocol in Cambodia;
- Report to the Royal Government on climate change issues, status of UNFCCC implementation and international negotiation processes;
- Promote education, awareness raising, training and information dissemination on climate change for the general public;
- Participate in national, regional and international conferences and workshops on climate change related issues;
- Coordinate and oversee the implementation of climate change projects, programmes and research activities in Cambodia;
- Review and approve work plans and reports of the Climate Change Technical Team (CCTT) to be established in accordance with Article 4 of this Sub-Decree;
- Promote international cooperation in the field of climate change.

The NCCC and its secretariat still lack technical capacity, guidelines, policies, regulations and resources for effective coordination and implementation of climate change projects and programmes and rely heavily on external resources for funding. However, capacity and resources mobilisation has gradually improved through the establishment of the Cambodia Climate Change Alliance (CCCA), a multi-donor initiative funded by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA), the Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA), and the European Commission (EC). The development objective of the CCCA programme is: “Climate change activities in Cambodia are nationally owned, led and aligned with Cambodia’s development priorities, and are effectively coordinated and implemented”. The future of the CCCA programme and its trust fund is unclear, that is, whether it will continue in the same manner after completion of the first phase of the programme or transforms into a more permanent mechanism for mobilisation and allocation of funds.

2.2 The Planning Process

Climate change planning is not considered as a separate planning exercise but rather one built upon and embedded in the National Strategic Development Plans (NSDP) and associated sector development plans. Usually, the planning department of each ministry compiles all sector strategies and plans, get them endorsed by the minister and submit them to the Ministry of Planning for consolidation into the NSDP. Approval of these plans as well as specific public investment programmes (PIP) is coordinated by the MOP and the Council for the Development of Cambodia (CDC). The role of the MEF is to negotiate with line ministries the proposed budgets for their planned activities, which will be consolidated into a budget law to be approved by the Parliament on an annual basis.

The climate change planning process nearly follows the practices and guidelines provided by the Ministry of Planning and the Council of Ministers. The distinction is that climate change planning requires a comprehensive understanding of climate change impacts and risks on the

basis of which projections are made and cost-effective policy responses are devised. Although many planning tools and guidelines have been developed by IPCC and various other organisations, it still poses a big challenge to devise the right responses due to the uncertainty inherent in climate change projections and resultant difficulties in risk and impact modeling on the one hand, and the socio-economic status in the communities and their lack of climate change adaptation capacity on the other hand. A template, tools and guidelines have been developed by the CCD with technical assistance from the CCCA. They are based on government procedures and international best practices on climate change planning but subject to further revision. Limited funding resources and competing development priorities are additional constraints to effective climate change mainstreaming at the national level.

Concerning the approval process, it is not clear if the sector climate change strategies and action plans (or PIP) must get endorsement by the NCCC before submission to the MOP, the CDC and the MEF. What is obvious at this stage is the coordination role that the NCCC can play, which includes promotion of capacity development and awareness raising, provision of guidelines and climate change risk/impacts assessment, GHG inventory and mitigation potential, and mobilisation of funding support from various sources. Initial work was carried out in the form of the preparation of national communications to the UNFCCC and development of a National Adaptation Program of Action (NAPA) in 2006, which function as initial planning and assessment tools and constitute a policy framework for adaptation responses in four priority sectors: agriculture; water resources; health; and coastal areas. A Cambodia Climate Change Strategic Plan (CCCSP) has been completed and approved by the Prime Minister together with Sector Climate Change Strategic Plans (SCCSP) for 10 line ministries, namely Ministry of Environment (MOE), Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF), Ministry of Water Resources and Meteorology (MOWRAM), Ministry of Industry, Mines and Energy (MIME), Ministry of Public Works and Transport (MPWT), Ministry of Rural Development (MRD), Ministry of Health (MOH), National Committee for Disaster Management (NCDM), Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports (MOEYS), and Ministry of Women Affairs (MOWA). Line ministries are now in the process of developing Climate Change Action Plans (CCAP) based on guidelines from the Council of Ministers. The CCAPs provide a list of prioritised actions for a period of five years consistent with the timeframe of the NSDP 2014-2018. Altogether, the CCCSP, SCCSPs and CCAPs provide a comprehensive framework for integration of climate change projects and programmes at national and sub-national levels.

In parallel with CCCA's procedures, the RGC, in collaboration with the World Bank (WB) and ADB, has developed the "Strategic Programme for Climate Resilience" (SPCR) aiming to support investments and capacity building activities for mainstreaming climate resilience into development policies, plans and projects. The Pilot Programme for Climate Change Resilience (PPCR) Phase one was developed with the assistance of the Asian Development Bank (ADB), WB and UNDP, and became effective in January 2011 with a grant of USD 1.5 million from the Climate Investment Fund (CIF). Its primary objective was to prepare the necessary ground work for Phase Two investments under the SPCR, which was structured into five components. Planning of the PPCR and the SPCR was based on a series of fact-finding ADB and WB missions which was carried out to identify potential climate resilience projects in consultation with line

ministries and other stakeholders. ADB also recognised the role that the NCCC and the CCTT had to play in the consultation process and for endorsement purposes. After endorsement by the NCCC, the MEF played a primary role in negotiations with donors on funding for PPCR projects and in making decisions on project financing portfolios. The Proposals under PPCR Phase II were prepared and approved by the CIF in June 2011 with a total cost of US\$ 86 million. The SPCR is now implemented with a potential funding of nearly US\$ 400 million for investment projects, mainly in the water resources, infrastructure and agriculture sectors.

It is understood that the climate change planning and budgeting process will evolve gradually, and that it may take some time before it becomes a routine exercise for government entities at the different levels. Its success will depend on the effective implementation of the evolving national administrative/financial management reforms as well as strong coordination between and clear division of tasks among the MEF, the MOP, the NCCC/MOE, line ministries and the National Committee for Democratic Development (NCDD) at the sub-national Level. Following the recent formation of the RGC of the fifth legislature, a new institutional structure of MEF has been approved by a sub-decree (16 Oct. 2013) leaving it with a total of 12 General Directorates, one of which may involve sub-national financing for climate change issues, i.e. the General Directorate of Finance for Sub-National Administration. Other ministries may be subject to restructuring as well. But most important will be to ensure the ability of consistent and sustainable allocation of government funds and funds from the international donor community to climate change mainstreaming at both national and sub-national levels, the smooth transfer of functions from national ministries to sub-national administrations, and that a sub-national climate change coordination mechanism is adopted as part of the decentralization and de-concentration (D&D) reform.

III. Climate Change Mainstreaming at the Sub-National Level

3.1 Institutional Structure

The current sub-national development planning is undertaken by two main entities: the provincial line departments which are linked to the central line ministries; and the provinces, districts/municipalities and commune/sangkat Councils which are linked to the Ministry of Interior (MOI) and the NCDD. Currently, the provincial departments follow the planning process and procedures as directed by both the central ministries and the provincial authorities, while the provincial, district and commune councils follow the planning process as specified in the Organic Law (May 2008) on “Administrative Management of the Capital, Municipalities, Districts and Khans”, the Law on “the Election of Capital Council, Provincial Councils, District Councils and Khan Councils” (May 2008), the Sub-Decree on the Development Plans and Three Year Rolling Investment Programs for Capital, Provinces, Municipalities, Districts and Khans (Dec 2009), and the Joint Prakas on Development Plans and Three Year Rolling Investment Programs for Capital, Provinces, Municipalities, Districts and Khans (Dec 2010).

As part of the D&D reform and based on Article 200 of the Organic Law, the provincial departments will most likely be transferred to the sub-national administrations. Their planning procedures will thus have to follow the NCDD regulations and guidelines, while the central line ministries will provide only policy advice. A Sub-decree on the Process of Transfer of Functions and Resources to the Sub-National Administrations was enacted in 2012 which stipulates the general process and timeframe for the transfer of functions and resources of various ministries and institutions to the local administration in accordance with the Organic Law and Law on Commune/ Sangkat Administrative Management (2001). However, only little progress has been made in this regard, perhaps due to the lack of clarity on resources transfer as well as inconsistency between the Organic Law and the Law on Public Financial Management¹ (ADB 2011).

The Organic Law stipulates the establishment of a sub-national institutional framework for development planning, comprising the NCDD, the Sub-National Councils, which include the Provincial Councils, Municipalities Councils, District/Khan Councils, the Technical Facilitation Committee, the Board of Governors, and Commune/Sangkat Councils.

a) National Committee for Democratic Development at Sub-National Level

The NCDD was established by a Royal Decree dated Dec 2008 pursuant to the Organic Law. The NCDD comprises 16 members assigned by key ministries and is chaired by the Minister of MOI. The MOE is not included as a member. The key role of the NCDD is to design and implement the national programme on democratic development at sub-national level in accordance with the Organic Law, the Law on Administrative Management of Communes/Sangkats (2001) and the Law on Public Financial System (PFS), as well as to consult and coordinate with all ministries/institutions in connection with the transfer of functions and responsibilities to sub-national councils which would include:

- Transfer of resources including revenue, finance, personnel, property, and capacity for managing and fulfilling the respective functions;
- Provision of capacity building and empower in order to get access to resources that are necessary for managing and fulfilling each function which includes revenue, finance, personnel, property, and capacity;
- Provision of power and duties to manage and perform all respective functions in line with the principles of local autonomy and local accountability to the maximum level.

In addition, the NCDD has established three sub-committees by a Sub-decree (Jan 2009), namely the Sub-committee on Functions and Resources; the Sub-committee on Financial and Fiscal Affairs; and the Sub-committee on Sub-national Administration Personnel. It is worth noting that the funding of the district and commune administrations is managed through the NCDD, although a large proportion of the funding is directed towards recurrent costs.

¹ The budgeting, approval and revenues are strongly controlled by MEF at national and sub-national levels. A draft Law on Financial Regime and State Property Management for Sub-national Administration is yet to be approved, which would improve resources allocation for local projects (ADB 2011).

b) Sub-National Councils

The municipal, provincial, district and khan councils are established by indirect elections for a term of five years. They are responsible for formulation and approval of five-year development plans (DP5) to be updated annually as parts of three-year rolling investment programmes (IP3); monitoring and evaluation of DP5 and IP3 implementation, approval of budget and expenditure plans, and management and use of assets. The Board of Governors is appointed by the Prime Minister and the MOI to support the councils in carrying out their functions, including implementation of the DP5 and the IP3, and provide oversight. In comparison with the national structure, the functions of the councils are similar to that of the Parliament, while the Board of Governors serves as an executive body.

c) Commune Councils

A commune council is established in each commune through direct elections every five years. Unlike provincial and district councils, the commune council is responsible for preparation and implementation of five-year development plans (CDP5) and three-year rolling investment programmes (CIP3) to be integrated into the district development plan and three-year rolling district investment programmes.

3.2 Procedures and Process for Sub-National Development Planning

The procedure and process for the development of the five-year provincial and district development plans and the three-year rolling investment programme are specified in a Sub-Decree dated Dec. 2009 and in a joint Prakas between the MOI and the MOP dated Dec 2010. The Planning Working Group (PWG) for the DP5 and the IP3 is composed of representatives of all provincial line departments and is chaired by the Provincial Governor. The chief of the Provincial Planning Department serves as a permanent member. The PWG is directly responsible for preparation of the plans including consultation with stakeholders.

The Planning of the provincial DP5 is a four-step process:

- Step 1: Development of work plan and schedule for implementation, including compilation of necessary documents;
- Step 2: Dissemination of information on the preparation of the DP5 to all stakeholders;
- Step 3: Formulation of the draft DP5 based on policy guidelines and procedures specified in the joint Prakas. Main activities include situation analysis and identification of challenges (socio-economic conditions, land use and environment management, status of disaster management and climate change, and administration and security), preparation of a M&E framework, as well as conducting consultations with stakeholders, Board of Governors and the technical facilitation committee. Step 3 provides a possibility for integrating climate change analysis and adaptation measures in the DP5. Development partners, NGOs and line departments can be involved in determining which specific projects or programmes should be included in the IP3.

- Step 4: Endorsement of the DP5 a review and revision through meetings of district/khan councils, prior endorsement by capital or provincial council, declaration on implementation of the DP5, and monitoring and evaluation.

The provincial DP5 shall be developed through broad stakeholder consultations involving the following:

- Capital/provincial Council
- Municipality, district or khan council;
- Technical Facilitation Committee and other committees under the district council;
- Board of Provincial, Municipal or District Governor;
- Provincial, municipal/district Planning Working Group;
- Offices or units of the district governor;
- Offices or units of line ministries based in the district and province;
- Commune councils;
- Communities;
- Civil society, NGOs and the private sector

Article 17 of the Joint Prakas stipulates the approval process for the provincial DP5, which requires involvement of the NCDD, the MOI and other concerned ministries. After official endorsement by the provincial council, the Board of Governors shall submit the draft DP5 to the Capital/Provincial Governor to revise accordingly and submit it to the NCDD Secretariat. The NCDD Secretariat will copy the DP5 to the MOI, the MOP and the MEF and coordinate the review and consultation process with these three ministries and other stakeholders to ensure that it is in conformity with government policies, laws, provisions and regulations. After consultations, the NCDD Secretariat will submit a summary report and recommendations to MOI for review and endorsement which must be done within 30 days of the day of submission

Box 1: Goals of DP5 on Land Use, Environment, Disaster and Climate Change in Koh Kong

Management of Land and Construction

- Establishing social land concession for poor people, handicap militants, and landless families;
- Development of land use master plan and land use planning according to development needs;
- Raising awareness on Land Law and Construction;
- Elimination of illegal land encroachment and demarcation of state land;

Forest

- Promoting sustainable use of forest resources;

Environment

- Improve solid waste management, sewage and strengthening protected area communities;

Natural Disaster

- Strengthening preparedness, prevention, and rescue measures in response to risk of natural disasters;

Climate Change

- Promoting response and adaptation to climate change.

by capital/provincial governor. This period should be spent on stakeholder consultations including clarifying any outstanding issues with the capital/provincial governor. In case of disagreement on the draft, the MOI must inform and request the NCDD to facilitate a solution. In the event of no response from the MOI within 30 days, it is assumed that the DP5 is endorsed. The next step is to publish and disseminate the DP5. The DP5 provides a general development framework consisting of vision, goals, objectives and strategies addressing four categories of issues: i) economic issues; ii) social issues; iii) land use and management of natural resources, environment, natural disaster and climate change; and iv) administration and security (see an example in Box 1). Since climate change is a cross-cutting issue, climate change projects can be mainstreamed in category i, ii, iii, which would involve many sectors such as water resources, agriculture, land use, forest, environment and health sectors. Box 1 serves as an illustration of the ability of Koh Kong Provincial Council to include climate change related goals in the DP5, although their achievement would depend on other factors such as funding availability and the capacity of the Board of Provincial Governors, the Board of the District Governor, the provincial line departments and the Commune Councils, respectively. This issue will be further elaborated in section IV.

The district DP5 is approved by the provincial governor within a timeframe of 30 days (Article 18) upon endorsement by the district council and submission of the draft by the district governor. In case of disagreement, the provincial governor shall inform and request the NCDD Secretariat to facilitate a solution. In case of no response from the provincial governor within 30 days, the district DP5 is assumed to be endorsed.

The development of the IP3, which is done annually, is a three-step process:

- Step 1: Identification of priority proposals, which involves reviewing the proposed investment projects, estimation of benefits, and conducting consultation;
- Step 2: Formulation of the IP3 including situation analysis; preparation of planning matrix, conducting integration workshop, classification of projects according to funding status, and preparation of recommendations for endorsement by the district council and district facilitation committee. The integration workshop is the most important part of the planning process where line departments, civil society, and NGOs are invited to contribute financial and technical inputs;
- Step 3: Endorsement of the IP3 requiring comments from and prior endorsement by the district council and approval by the provincial governor.

Proposed IP3 projects are grouped into three planning matrices: projects already under implementation, projects with funding commitments, and projects without funding commitments.

Provincial line departments still mainly follow the guidelines, policies, and laws and regulations of the respective central line ministries, but their planning also reflects local needs and challenges. The annual and three-year plans are submitted together with budgets to the central ministries for review and endorsement before the planned budgets will be submitted to the

MEF for approval. The MEF may negotiate with the line ministries for budget adjustments based on the predetermined budget ceilings of the RGC before the approved budgets are transferred to the local departments through the respective ministries. Implementation of specific projects by the sub-national departments is based on the budget threshold of each central line ministry. For example, the threshold for the Provincial Department of Water Resources and Meteorology is fixed at 500-1000 million riels. Above that threshold, project implementation would be carried out by the MOWRAM. These planning, approval and implementation procedures may change after the transfer of functions of line ministries to the sub-national level pursuant to the Organic Law. Currently, the main constraints for effective development planning at provincial line departments are the limited budget and capacity.

Commune development planning is carried out in a five-step process:

- Step 1: Drafting the development framework, which identifies commune needs, goals and strategies, and the estimation of resource expenditures (capital and current) for five years;
- Step 2: Consultations with stakeholders, including local communities, line departments, NGOs, civil society, members of commune council, provincial and district facilitators and planning specialists;
- Step 3: Drafting the Commune Development Plan (CDP);
- Step 4: Endorsement of the CDP;
- Step 5: Monitoring and evaluation.

The commune planning and budgeting Committee (CPBC) is established to prepare the CDP5 and the CIP3. The draft CDP5 is submitted to the provincial governor by the district governor for approval. The review of the plans is conducted with the assistance of the local administration, provincial line departments and the planning department (MOP). The CPBC and the commune clerk will revise the CDP5 according to the Provincial Governor's recommendations, after which the commune council will adopt it. Development of the CIP3 is undertaken annually following almost the same steps, but stakeholder consultation and consolidation of comments is conducted at the District Integration Workshop (DIW) held in October or November. Step 2 and step 3 are critical for NGOs, donors and other funding organisations as they provide opportunities for having their preferred projects included in the CDP5 and the CIP3 and entering into temporary contract agreements with commune councils at the DIW.

3.3 The Process Approach used for Mainstreaming Climate Change

Institutional framework of the CARP

The institutional framework for climate change mainstreaming consists of a National Working Group of Focal Officers (NWG) and Technical Working Groups (TWGs) established in each province under the Governor's Office. The members of the NWG represent several departments (MAFF, EIA/MOE, CCD/MOE, GIS/MOE, NCDM, MOWRAM, MLMUPC, and the NCDD). The role of the NWG is to facilitate cooperation and communication with respective

ministries, participate in climate change implementation, capacity building and integration of climate change adaptation and mitigation into planning and policy, and to provide advice to the TWGs. The TWGs are chaired by deputy governors and have members assigned from key provincial departments, district offices and commune councils. The TWGs participate in ad-hoc meetings, provide comments on demonstration projects and attend training sessions on climate change planning and implementation. It is expected that the TWGs could function as the coordinating unit for climate change actions and planning at the provincial level being capacitated through the training organised by the CARP and the parallel LDCF project.

Approach for Planning and Integration of Climate Change Projects in the Target Communes

As mentioned earlier, one of the CARP outputs is demonstration of six coastal adaptation projects in eight communes of Prey Nob and Mondol Seima districts in Preah Sihanouk Ville and Koh Kong provinces. They are the following:

1. Integrated Farming Training Programme for (a) agricultural extension staff and (b) households/families in multi-scale climate change adaptation strategies and integrated farming (integration of crops, livestock, fish, and water) at eight target communes¹. This is preceded by agro- ecological analysis as an integral part and includes demonstration in on-farm water management measures. This demonstration activity is implemented in partnership with the Department of Agricultural Extension, MAFF.
2. Community Fisheries project at Peam Krasaob Commune; especially in terms of strengthening regulatory measures and their enforcement as preconditions for making the livelihood of fishing communities more adaptable to climate change. This demonstration activity is implemented in partnership with the Fisheries Administration, MAFF.
3. Promotion and increased availability of shorter duration seeds for rice crops; particularly for wet-season paddy possibly enabling harvest before onset of heavy flooding and sea water surges in the target communes. Such varieties have been tested (at no cost to farmers) in specific localities, where they are likely to be effective. This demonstration activity is implemented in partnership with the Cambodia Agricultural Research and Development Institute, MAFF.
4. Promotion of increased livestock keeping in the target communes; by using a revolving scheme for improved breeds as a response to increased flooding problems. The demonstration activity is implemented in partnership with the Center for Livestock and Agriculture Development (CelAgrid) and the Project Management Unit, MAFF.
5. Climate change awareness building and training on climate change resistant irrigation in the target communes will be conducted applying experience from previous work in Cambodia. The training will be done in all target communes. The demonstration activity is implemented in partnership with a NGO, Department of Environmental Education,

MoE and the Technical Working Groups which are directly responsible for the implementation of climate change awareness building.

6. Adaptation measures integrated in Commune Development Plans in the target communes. Concrete demonstration activities are carried out based on the planned activities in the 2013 commune investment plans which will make local communities more resilient to climate change impacts. The demonstration activities are conducted in cooperation with the commune councils, districts and the TWGs.

Identification, selection and integration of these demonstration projects have followed the steps outlined below while using the established structures at provincial and commune level as described above:

- Situation Analysis: This was based on a review of CARP studies and field consultation with various stakeholders ranging from TWGs, commune councils and villagers as a basis for identification of climate risks and responses. The CARP studies included: Assessment of Coping Strategies in the Coastal Zone of Cambodia, Vulnerability of Existing Agricultural Practices; Assessment of Community Vulnerability and Risk from Climate Change in Coastal Areas; Analysis of Cost and Benefits for modifying Agricultural Practices in the Coast; and Support to CC Education, Awareness Building and FWUC Strengthening.
- Identification of Demonstration Projects: About 20 projects were identified through consultation and prioritisation meetings held in July-November 2012 with cooperation partners, NGOs, TWGs, commune councils and villagers. The number of projects was further reduced to six as shown above based on a ranking and selection process involving both the TWGs and the Commune Councils.
- Integration of Demonstration Projects in the CIP3: The projects have been prepared in the existing commune format and for the Commune Councils to consider and include in the CIP3, which will be reviewed at the District Integration Workshop to be held in November 2013. However, the climate change actions could not be integrated in the current CDP5 since it is only developed every five years. A template for climate change screening of commune investment projects has also been prepared.
- Implementation: The projects are now under implementation for a two-year period (2013-14) in cooperation with the partners at provincial and commune level previously mentioned.

The lessons learnt from this implementation approach are the following:

- The current development planning procedures and guidelines at the sub-national level provide a good opportunity for climate change integration.
- Lack of capacity and funding at the sub-national level is the main obstacle to proper climate change adaptation. The current commune budgets are about US\$ 20,000 which

can only finance rehabilitation of small-scale infrastructure such as roads, wells and rain water harvest.

- At present, there is no clear and effective coordination mechanism in place at the sub-national level but the established TWGs could perform this role provided their capacity is continuously strengthened through the training activities undertaken by the CARP and the LDCF.
- There is limited support of and communication between provincial line departments and commune councils during the formulation of the CDP5 and the CIP3 due to an insufficient budget and weak capacity of the line departments. The TWGs would be in a good position to provide the required technical support in the future.
- Integration of climate change projects in the current commune database proves problematic as their names are rejected because they do not conform to specific criteria defined by the MOP and planning departments.
- While the current commune proposal format contains environmental aspects, it does not contain specific climate change related issues. Thus, the CARP has proposed the development of a template on climate change, which could formally be included in future government guidelines.

IV. Proposed Coordination Mechanism for Sub-national Mainstreaming of Climate Change

For the sub-national climate change integration to be effective and sustainable, four main elements must be considered and improved upon, encompassing institutional coordination, planning and budgeting procedures, capacity development, and monitoring and evaluation.

Institutional Coordination: As discussed earlier, the NCCC's role is mainly limited to operating at the national level - it has too few resources and little capacity to influence the sub-national climate change planning. It should be considered to provide the TWGs with a clear mandate for climate change coordination and planning as they already have sufficient capacity to do so. The sub-national planning and institutional structure has become more visible and robust, which will enable the integration of almost all aspects of development, including climate change, in the sub-national DP and IP3. As part of the D&D reform, functions and resources of national ministries will be transferred to sub-national administrations, though it may take a long time before it materialises. Therefore, it would be rational to build on good practices from the implementation of the CARP, as this project has had sufficient time and resources available to build up capacity in a targeted and continuous manner. Other projects such as the PPCR and the Local Government and Climate Change Project (LGCC) have also attempted to develop models for mainstreaming climate change at the sub-national level but without actual implementation in communities or with limited budgets.

Building on NCCC and TWG experience, it is proposed to establish a *Climate Change Coordination Unit (CCCU)* or perhaps a *committee (CCCC)* with a technical secretariat based in

the Governor's Office. The current TWGs could be transformed into the CCCU with additional members representing other sectors, including e.g. health, rural development, fisheries, energy, transport, NGOs, Community Based Organizations (CBO), Farmer Water User Committees (FWUC), and the private sector. In the meantime, the TWGs could invite representatives of other departments or institutions to participate in the targeted training. The chair of the CCCU should be selected from among provincial councilors who would be in a good position to raise climate change issues at regular council meetings. The role of the CCCU would be to provide technical assistance on climate change adaptation, review and endorse climate change projects and plans, promote capacity building, coordinate funding flow, and conduct monitoring and evaluation. Technical backstopping can be secured from the NCCC - perhaps through the CCTT - to guide development of climate change strategies and action plans. A small technical secretariat should be established in the Governor's Office with staff recruited from relevant departments, namely environment, water resources, agriculture, forestry, disaster management, land management and with a GIS/mapping facility. Funding of the CCCU and its secretariat should be part of the provincial budget that flows through the NCDD.

Planning and Budgeting Procedures (PBP): The current planning procedures and guidelines are well designed but there are deficiencies regarding the climate change integration proposal format as it does not include sufficient information, the considerations on adaptation and disaster management are too limited, the participation of line departments in the planning process is irregular, and the general understanding of climate change implications for the sector and livelihoods is weak. The CARP has tried to overcome these deficiencies through capacity building and will continue its efforts in this regard. Nevertheless, adjustments should be made to the existing guidelines based on a review. Another important constraint is the low funding allocation for sub-national planning in general, and climate change in particular. The CCCU can advocate for increased funding for CC as part of the planned transfer of resources from the central government to the sub-national level. But more critical is the question of aligning this aspect of the D&D reform with the Public Financial Management Reform undertaken by the MEF. It is clear that without sufficient funding the integration of climate change would be difficult to achieve. Currently, only 20% of the total budget for CC is financed through sub-national transfers, and prospects for increased funding in the near future look bleak. The NCDD and the NCCC must work together in developing a climate change financing framework which can secure stable funding from the RGC and international funding mechanisms such as the CIF, the Green Climate Fund (GCF), the Global Environmental Facility (GEF) and the Least Developing Country Fund (LDCF), the Adaptation Fund etc.

Capacity Development: It has been confirmed by many studies and reports that institutional capacity and knowledge on CC is weak at all levels, and that it is weakest at the sub-national level. Continued capacity development of the CCCU and its secretariat is needed to enable it to coordinate planning and promote awareness building in an effective manner. The NCCC and the CCCA can assist in scaling-up the ongoing capacity development in the CARP's target communes and expanding it into more coastal areas and other provinces building on past experiences and lessons learnt. The present coastal activities should be expanded and copied for other

provinces as a sustainable approach for sub-national climate change mainstreaming and institutional development for selected provinces as a viable approach of interventions.

Monitoring and Evaluation: The existing M&E system for the DP5 covers development and administration aspects well, but contains very few indicators for climate change. Some indicators could be relevant for both economic and climate change categories, for example the length of sea dikes built, areas of mangrove planted, and testing of short-term rice varieties. Current village, commune and district databases do not have sufficient information about climate change factors. The information largely concerns impacts from natural disasters. Moreover, there is no consistency between these databases, e.g. the commune database contains information on areas affected by flooding and drought, while village data only record the number of people affected by flooding. Thus, village information may not be available for monitoring and evaluation at the commune level. Therefore, M&E indicators, based upon data and information collected in a proper manner at village and commune level, should be further developed and then integrated into a provincial database under the auspices of the CCCU.

V. Links between National and Sub-national Climate Adaptation

The CARP is shaped on the particular climate adaptation agenda in the Coastal Zone, with its distinct concerns and opportunities, several of which are shared with the Mekong Basin parts of the country, while others are specific to the coastal area.

Lessons are still being learned (within and beyond the CARP and the LDCF project) about the potential and practicalities of sub-national climate adaptation. Additional lessons and documentation will emerge well after project completion - for example about the full benefits of improved production technology and of functional ecosystems, both of which will no doubt contribute to the over-all national socio-economic development.

Particular interfaces with the national level exist in the following areas:

- Education, awareness-building, and active community participation: The CARP operates at the household/community level, and at the sub-national administrative (province, district and commune) levels, emphasizing the links between sustainable, resource-based livelihoods, poverty alleviation, environmental conservation and climate resilience. The benefits of active community participation have been clearly confirmed already at this stage of CARP implementation. Notably, the CARP can contribute '*ground-truthing*' of the adaptation approaches piloted during the pilot activities at the household, community and commune levels.
- Institutional capacity-building: The CARP is oriented towards the climate-related concerns, opportunities, cause-effect relationships (across social, economic and

environmental impacts), and viable management options at the sub-national level.

Parts of the education and capacity-building efforts are specific to the coastal zone, such as preservation of coastal and marine habitats and ecosystems, and impacts of sea level rise and saline intrusion. Other parts, equally well received by the participants, are generic, introducing basic concepts and tools for climate resilience and adaptation.

Dissemination is taking place via thematic reporting, production of courseware and guidelines (presently 20 training documents), and active participation in seminars and networking.

The CARP is firmly committed to a continuous dialogue, sharing observations, suggestions and recommendations in support of the evolving national mainstreaming processes. NCDD and MOP are seen as key partners in this connection, with NCCC and its secretariat providing important support in many ways, including activation of inter-sector synergies. The efforts may conveniently include bilateral consultations with bodies involved in national and sub-national climate adaptation, once the initial experience has been documented and conceptualized.

VI. Conclusion

Climate change planning and mainstreaming is now undertaken at various levels with notable progress achieved at the national level. The Cambodia Climate Change Strategic Plan and Sector Climate Change Strategic Plans have been adopted, which provides a comprehensive policy framework for integration of climate change at national and sub-national levels. Several initiatives and ongoing projects are implemented at provincial levels using both government and international planning practice. The Coastal Adaptation and Climate Resilience Planning component of the CCCA has been implemented since 2012 in eight communes in Prey Nob and Mondol Seima districts in Preah Sihanouk and Koh Kong provinces. The CARP's approach – implementation of demonstration activities and integration of climate change considerations into Commune Development Plans - is based on current government planning procedures and guidelines for sub-national administrations. CARP experience indicates that a clear opportunity exists for mainstreaming climate change into the DP5 and the IP3. However, a lack of formal institutional structures and guidelines will make it difficult to sustain it at the sub-national level. Based on a comprehensive analysis of the current institutional structure for climate change planning at the national level and taking into consideration the parameters of the ongoing D&D reform, the establishment of a Climate Change Coordination Unit as part of the NCCC and the NCDD is proposed. It would benefit from already developed capacity within the TWGs and could recruit additional members using D&D rules and regulations. Its overriding tasks would be to improve planning and budgeting procedures, promote capacity development and establish M&E systems for sub-national climate change planning and implementation. When the improved institutional framework for climate change planning and implementation has been put in place, ongoing activities should be expanded into more coastal areas and inland provinces.

References

1. Circular on the Establishment of Project Steering Committee, MOE 2012;
2. Circular on the Establishment of Working Group of Focal Officers, MOE, 2012;
3. Circular on the Establishment of Provincial Working Group for CARP, 2012;
4. DHI, 2012, "Assessment of Coping Strategies in the Coastal Zone of Cambodia";
5. DHI, 2012, "Vulnerability of Existing Agricultural Practices";
6. DHI, 2012 "Assessment of Community Vulnerability and Risk from Climate Change in Coastal Areas";
7. DHI, 2012 "Analysis of Cost and Benefits for Modifying Agricultural Practices in the Coast";
8. DHI, 2012 "Support to CC Education, Awareness Building and FWUC Strengthening";
9. DHI, 2013, "Detailed Implementation Plan for Demonstration Activities at the Coast", MOE/CCCA;
10. Inter-ministerial Joint Prakas, Dec. 2010, "Development of Development Plan and Investment Program", MOI & MOP.
11. Koh Kong Provincial Governor, "Five Year Development Plan of Koh Kong 2011-2015";
12. Law on Administrative Management of Capital/Provinces/Municipalities/Districts, 2008;
13. MOE, WB & ADB, 2013, "Private Sector Scoping Study: Engaging the Private Sector in Climate Change Adaptation Investments";
14. MoE/DHI, 2013 "Guidance on Mainstreaming Climate Resilience and Disaster Risk Reduction into Sub-National Development and Investment Planning";
15. MOI/DHI, 2013 "Case Study: Climate Proofing of Investment Projects in Takeo Province";
16. Royal Decree on the "Establishment of National Committee for Democratic Development at the Sub-National Level, MOI 2008;
17. Royal Decree on the "Establishment of National Committee for Management and Development of Cambodian Coastal Areas", Feb 2012;
18. Sub-Decree on "General Processes of Transfer of Functions and Resources to the Sub-National Administrations", MOI, May 2012;
19. Sub-Decree on the "Establishment of National Climate Change Committee", April 2006;
20. Tariq, H Niazi, 2011, Decentralization and De-concentration Reforms in Cambodia, ADB.

Annexes – Commune Investment Plans & Small Scale Project Proposals

1. Prey Nob Commune, Prey Nob District, Preah Sihanouk Province
2. Tuol Totoeng Commune, Prey Nob District, Preah Sihanouk Province
3. Touk Laak Commune, Prey Nob District, Preah Sihanouk Province
4. Touk Thla Commune, Prey Nob District, Preah Sihanouk Province
5. Okhna Heng Commune, Prey Nob District, Preah Sihanouk Province
6. Samaki Commune, Prey Nob District, Preah Sihanouk Province
7. Peam Krasoab Commune, Mondol Seima District, Koh Kong Province
8. Tuol Kokir Commune, Mondol Seima District, Koh Kong Province